

Charles F. Parham, Indefatigable Toil and Launching the World-wide Pentecostal
Movement: A New Look at a Forgotten Leader

Jeffery Nelson*

Abstract

This paper contends Charles Parham, though flawed, should be given great credit for the modern Pentecostal Movement. He is presented as the theological father of the doctrines of the movement and as a tireless promoter of the movement from Stone's Folly to Azusa and to the end of his life in 1929. His doctrine and influence had a tremendous impact on all Pentecostal denominations formed in the first half of the twentieth century. Three great negative attacks on his life and ministry are analyzed in order to suggest the reason he has been intentionally forgotten by Pentecostal scholars. It is argued that these should not be sufficient cause to ignore his significant contributions to the Pentecostal and Charismatic movements that have changed the world.

Introduction

This paper proposes it was the indefatigable¹ Charles Fox Parham, the applecart pusher,² who changed the world through the Pentecostal movement. The intent of this paper is to demonstrate that no other person has made a greater impact on the growth of Pentecostalism around the world than Charles Parham. Finally, this paper advances the idea that Parham as a figure in Pentecostal history, who though flawed, provides an inspiration for Pentecostal believers today.

The first section will investigate who was Charles Parham. The second section will consider the swirling environment in which he lived and the thoughts and theology that he

* Jeff and Janelle Nelson are missionaries to Africa, currently serving as coordinator of Africa Library Services and Distribution Centers based in Springfield, Missouri. The Nelsons have served as pastors for 16 years and in missions since 2000. Jeff led KAG EAST University in Nairobi, Kenya for eight years. They have a passion for unreached people groups, church planting, mobilizing missionaries, and higher Christian education. The Nelsons have four grown children and five grandchildren. Jeff and Janelle Nelson have a burden to "prepare God's people for works of service".

developed as a result. The third section will summarize the origins of the Pentecostal Movement, particularly surrounding the outpouring at Topeka, Kansas in January 1901 and its expansion to Texas and then to Azusa Street Mission in 1906 and beyond. The fourth section will delve into his year of thorns when he faced three devastating assaults on his ministry. The fifth section will look at living with the thorns and how his life and ministry was affected by the year of thorns that he carried the rest of his life. The sixth section will focus on his lasting influence, proposing that Pentecostal denominations founded in the years immediately following 1901 can trace its roots to Charles Parham and concludes with his death.

1. Who is Charles Fox Parham?

Who is Charles Fox Parham? Is he the father of the modern Pentecostal Movement? Is he the theologian who introduced speaking in tongues as the Bible evidence of the baptism in the Holy Spirit to the Christian world? Or is he a racist? Is he sexually deviant? Is he a man fixated with authority, power, fame, and building a name and kingdom for himself? This paper seeks to answer critics concerning the three major accusations centering around the years 1906-1907 concerning sexual accusations, racism, and authority.

The fastest growing phenomenon in world religious history

The Pentecostal Movement, with its offspring involving the Charismatic and Third Wave Movements,³ has been called, the “fastest growing phenomenon in world religious history.”⁴ The movement that God used Charles Parham to ignite has grown to half a billion adherents in 115 years, while it took the Catholic church 1900 years to reach the same number.⁵ Islam, often quoted as the fastest growing religion,⁶ is growing at a rate of 3,350 adherents per year since its inception, while the Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement has grown at the rate of 15,469 adherents per year since its inception.⁷ It is therefore reasonable to conclude that the Pentecostal/Charismatic Movement is the fastest growing phenomenon in world religious history.

Greatest impact on the Pentecostal Movement

But can we also conclude that this has a direct connection to Parham? Can we conclude that no other person has made a greater impact on the growth of Pentecostalism around the world than Charles Parham? While it has been argued that there have been spiritual gifts manifested throughout the centuries including speaking in tongues,⁸ after the first Christian century until the outpouring of January 1, 1901, these were largely local geographic events with limited duration.

Two elements were absent in these events that were present in the movement God ignited through Parham. First, there was not a theological understanding that speaking in tongues was the Bible evidence of the Baptism in the Holy Spirit, as identified and taught by Parham.⁹ And second, there was not a world-wide outpouring of the Holy Spirit that affected every continent as happened following Parham's identification and tireless teaching on the subject.

Candle light services are popular with youth groups and churches. They demonstrate how that from one candle, all of the other candles in the room receive their flames. Like a candle light service, outpourings during the second to nineteenth centuries had ignited a group in local geographic areas who had candles lit, but after a generation or so, all lights were out. Parham saw the spark ignited at Topeka as a sacred trust, and he worked with both the delicate worshipful heart of Mary and the strong work ethic of Martha to ensure that every person he could reach had their candle lit before his time on earth was finished. The candles God lit at Stone's Folly in January 1901 began igniting others from Topeka to Baxter Springs, KS, to Houston, TX to Zion, IL, to New York, NY, to Los Angeles, CA, to many other countries (including but limited to South Africa, China, Japan, Korea, and Australia)¹⁰ even before Azusa Street (1906-1909). Then "so many missionaries went out from Azusa (some 38 left in October 1906) that within two years, the movement had spread to over 50 nations, including Britain, Scandinavia, Germany, Holland (the Netherlands), Egypt, Syria, Palestine, South Africa, Hong Kong, China, Ceylon (now Sri Lanka), and India. Christian leaders visited from all over the world."¹¹ The light of the first candle lit in January 1901 was carried by hand and printed page and lit hundreds of thousands of candles in at least 50 countries around the world within a decade.

The spread of Pentecostalism

Most often the Pentecostal theology and experience traveled through people who were in meetings where they received this baptism, but sometimes through written media, people read the testimonies of others and sought that God might also give them everything he has. J. Roswell Flower states, “From there (Azusa) it spread to all parts of the earth, for ... every Pentecostal unit in existence today can be traced back to that obscure beginning in the State of Kansas.”¹² Everywhere to which the Pentecostal message spread around the world and every denomination that calls itself Pentecostal today can be traced back to Parham. Even those local groups that experienced speaking in tongues just prior to 1901, which were still operating in the gifts of the Spirit, began choosing to attach themselves to the Pentecostal Movement because of their agreement with the spirit and teaching of the movement. The Scandinavians of North Dakota and Minnesota¹³ and the Church of God in Christ, Memphis, TN, serve as examples of these mergers¹⁴.

Pentecostal denominations

The Pentecostal denominations that emerged in the first 20 years after the outpouring at Topeka all had direct lines back to Parham: Apostolic Faith (1906), Church of God in Christ, founded by C. H. Mason (1897), and the Church of God (Cleveland, Tennessee) established by A. J. Tomlinson (1906).¹⁵ The first eight Executive Presbyters selected at the first General Council of the Assemblies of God in Hot Springs, AR in 1914 had a direct line back to Parham. Four of them directly and the other four through Azusa Street.¹⁶

Parham had the greatest impact

Since every Pentecostal group in existence today can trace its roots back to Parham, it can be stated that no other person has made a greater impact on the growth of Pentecostalism around the world than Charles Parham. Parham held the candle ignited at the first Holy Spirit fire fall and he carried it to thousands, who then carried it to thousands more, until today, one quarter of all Christians and nearly ten percent of all people on Earth are holding lit candles of the Spirit.¹⁷

Parham considered himself an applecart pusher.

“The Lord used the Apostolic Faith Movement as an applegate to push the truth of Pentecost along in, until it became a world-wide blessing. It had fulfilled its mission, and now fades in the light of recognition of a general world-wide fellowship in extending the hand of love to all Full Gospel Movements and Churches. The heritage of this truth is the divine right of all the children of God, and the result cannot be harvested by one man or one movement.”¹⁸

Though uniquely used by God for this purpose, he remained humble and left it all in God’s hands. So who was this man that God so greatly used?

2. Swirling Environment

How did this all begin? Parham lived in a swirling environment at the end of the 19th century. Theologies were swirling in the American religious and cultural pot that effected all those living therein. He was born on June 4, 1873, in Muscatine, Iowa.¹⁹ He, with his family, traveled West by Prairie Schooner and grew up in Eastern Kansas, rarely attending church or Sunday school.²⁰ He was a sickly (often invalid) child, who took a keen interest in spiritual things and wrestled with God over his own healing and later that of his son.²¹ He trained at Southwestern Kansas, a Methodist college²² and pastored two Methodist churches simultaneously as a young man.²³ He soon rejected church hierarchy,²⁴ but he had a great love for God, his people, and desired others to spend eternity with him.²⁵

He married Sarah Thistlethwaite on December 31, 1896²⁶ and they had six children (one died in infancy).²⁷ His wife and children were loving and loyal family members who believed in him and the message he taught. The preacher in the pulpit was the man they knew at home.

Restorationist

He grew to believe in a restorationist theology that those things he read about in the New Testament could and should happen in his time.²⁸ He had a deep sense of the soon-approaching return of Christ and was compelled to preach the gospel so Christ would have many join him at his return.²⁹ Through conversations with his future grandfather-in-law, David Baker, he discussed the end-times, annihilationism, and pacificism.³⁰ Through discussions with Bishop J. H. Allen, he learned of Anglo-Israelism and embraced it.³¹ The Anglo- or British-Israelism movement, which believed that Anglo peoples were among the lost 10 tribes of Israel, had two-million adherents by 1901.³² In 1900 he set off on a 3,500 mile-tour, visiting restorationists,

missionary mobilizers, and faith healers. He visited Dowie in Chicago, IL; Malone in Cleveland, OH; Simpson in Nyack, NY; and Sanford in Shiloah, ME seeking to learn from them how to see the church restored to its New Testament reality.³³

Parham's guiding theological center was that he wanted to see people come to Jesus, live holy lives, experience all that the apostolic (New Testament) church experienced and live forever with Christ in Heaven. He preached Jesus as the same yesterday, today, and forever;³⁴ what Jesus and the Apostles did, we can do today;³⁵ in the last days God will pour out his Spirit on all people;³⁶ and this is the time for a world harvest like never seen before.³⁷ Even those theologies many struggle with today seem to fit his guiding theological center. In annihilationism he believed that God would welcome repentant sinners into Heaven to be with him but lovingly destroy the souls that rejected him so that they would not suffer eternal punishment. In pacifism he believed that believers can suffer as Christ did when opposition came to him. In British-Israelism he believed that the Anglo peoples were the lost 10 tribes of Israel and they had a responsibility to preach Christ to all peoples.

It is important that one does not judge historical figures by present theological understanding. Presentism is the "uncritical adherence to present-day attitudes, especially the tendency to interpret past events in terms of modern values and concepts."³⁸ Scholars accept Luther's theology of justification by faith, but reject his theology on the Jews,³⁹ and still honor him for his contribution for changing the world through the Protestant Reformation. Howard suggests that Luther "should be honored (for his theology of justification by faith) but not celebrated (for his theology of the Jews)."⁴⁰ In a similar way could Charles Parham be given honor for his theology of Bible evidence while not celebrated for his theology of British-Israelism or other areas, as he was caught up in the swirling environment of his day?

As a young man growing up in the Assemblies of God, I was told that while other churches had a human founder such as Luther or Wesley, the Pentecostal Movement had no human origin, but it was simply a move of the Spirit. It was explained as a latter rain⁴¹ that God spontaneously poured out beginning at the turn of the 20th century. While in some ways this is true, the fact that God used one man, Charles Parham, to discover the doctrine of Bible evidence and then work indefatigably until his death to spread it was never taught – at least to me. I heard his name and read the stories of Stone's Folly and Topeka. I heard about the great outpouring of Azusa Street. But it was often noted that no man began the movement.

The hesitancy to properly credit Parham may be due to a few reasons. First, because of his accusations and therefore questionable moral life, some may have chosen to sideline his place in the history of the Pentecostal Movement. Second, because of his dislike of church hierarchy and his aversion to forming his own organization, he left little organized work to his credit. Finally, because he viewed himself simply as an applecart pusher to spread this great outpouring to the world, Parham never felt the need to promote himself to his followers. For whatever reason, Pentecostal history has largely disregarded this tireless leader who changed the world.

3. Origins of the Pentecostal Movement

In October 1900 he opened Bethel Bible School in a building known as Stone's Folly in Topeka, KS.⁴² The only textbook was the Bible and all students had to live by faith.⁴³ In late December he gave the 40 enrolled students⁴⁴ an assignment. "I set the students at work studying out diligently what was the Bible evidence of the baptism of the Holy Ghost, that we might go before the world with something that was indisputable because it tallied absolutely with the Word."⁴⁵ He returned three days later, and on December 31, 1900, he called the students together for a report and a watch night service. The students reported their findings, "the indisputable proof on each occasion was, that they spake (*sic*) with other tongues."⁴⁶ During the prayer meeting with about 115 individuals⁴⁷ that followed, lasting "two nights and three days," the Holy Spirit fell first on Agnes Ozman, later on 12 ministers of different denominations, and on Parham.⁴⁸ This was the spark that ignited the "fastest growing phenomenon in world religious history."⁴⁹ And Charles F. Parham was the match God used to ignite this spark.

From the next 29 years and 29 days (he passed away on January 29, 1929),⁵⁰ Charles Parham worked tirelessly to see this latter rain of the Holy Spirit spread across the whole earth. He strongly believed,

"If that great commission is carried out, if the evangelization of the world is to be accomplished, it must be through this movement, I believe. Beginning both in Judea and Jerusalem, and in Samaria and unto the uttermost parts of the earth, it must be preached, and this movement is the agency that, in the providence of God, is to fully accomplish the world-wide work."⁵¹

His statement in 1906 was echoed later. The Assemblies of God was formed in 1914 and the Second General Council, held in Chicago in November 1914, resolved to achieve "the

greatest evangelism that the world has ever seen.”⁵² The vision of Parham was alive in churches that were lit from his candle.

Living by faith

Parham lived by faith and expected those who came to his Bible schools and healing homes to do the same. The students were not charged tuition, room, or board,⁵³ but everyone, including Parham and his family, were expected to live by faith for God to provide. He had been repulsed by ministers who spent more time asking for money than school teachers when preachers only worked about one-sixth of the time a teacher does.⁵⁴ Parham never took offerings⁵⁵ in his meetings. He lived by faith throughout his entire ministry.

Indefatigable ministry

Many times he would preach two or three times a day for weeks at a time in a town, a village, or a city. When he was in Zion City and had to meet in homes rather than a hall, he would travel to five homes in a night, preaching typically from 7:00 pm until Midnight.⁵⁶ Many years Charles Parham traveled between 5,000 and 8,000 miles by horse and buggy, then train, and then automobile holding campaigns across the U.S. He likely traveled between 100,000 and 200,000 miles in his 35 years of ministry. Additionally he started Bible schools,⁵⁷ healing homes,⁵⁸ orphan and widow ministries,⁵⁹ and took teams of workers to the streets and missions.⁶⁰ He kept up this evangelistic ministry for about 35 years, and he never seemed to tire of reaching people for Jesus. When he was only about 32 years old, The Houston Chronicle reported in 1906, “He remarked on the doctrine of healing held by the adherents of his faith. ‘Over 100,000 people in the United States today are trusting God for healing.’”⁶¹ Near the end of his life in 1928, Connelly wrote in *A Standard History of Kansas and Kansans*, “A New York statistician has given Mr. Parham credit for the conversion of fully 2,000,000 persons.”⁶² If these numbers are indicative of the growth of the Pentecostal movement during his lifetime, it is not surprising that today, there are over 650 million Pentecostal/Charismatic believers around the world.⁶³ Jesus said, “But the seed falling on good soil refers to someone who hears the [W]ord and understands it. This is the one who produces a crop, yielding a 100, 60 or 30 times what was sown” (John 13:23 NIV). The seed that fell in Parham’s heart in January 1901 has produced a crop yielding

hundreds of millions of what was sown. The persecution he received as a result of his theology, he counted worth for the cause of Christ.

Parham wrote near his last year of life,

Twenty-eight years ago, baptized in the Holy Ghost and scarcely a day since that, I have not spoken in tongues. My dear friends of many years will know that I have served faithfully [through] days of indefatigable toil and nights of blackness and storm. No days were so cold and terrible or nights so frightful but what it was joy to run His errand; ever on the wing on errands of mercy and missions of love. The mighty deserts or rugged mountains, or distances long, but what it was joy to me to rush to help, feed[,] or comfort my loved ones in the Lord.⁶⁴

And also,

Brethren[,] let us rise to the emergency of the hour, to the privilege that God has given us, and to spread the [g]ospel of [f]ull salvation and preparation for our coming redemption to the end of the earth. Remembering that selfish motive in our work for God is un Christ-like and that He left an example, that without considering ourselves, our own comforts or convenience or our own pleasure in the matter that we should pour our lives out in unselfish sacrificial service to our fellow men. Anything less than this would be unworthy of the high and holy calling to which God has ordained us.⁶⁵

Through Parham's indefatigable life he sought to fulfill his call to preach the gospel to as many as God would allow him to preach. Could this not inspire Pentecostal believers today?

Not starting a church or denomination

Parham considered himself simply an applecart pusher.⁶⁶ The apples were the Pentecostal truths. The applecart was the band of Apostolic Faith workers who fervently traveled from place to place across the country and around the world distributing the apples, the truths, and the experience of the Spirit. While he believed in the potential of the Pentecostal Movement and understood that God expected him to distribute Pentecost to all he could, it was not his movement, but God's. He never wanted to start a church but hoped this restoration of the gifts of the Spirit and evangelism would permeate within every church. He never sought to start a denomination, but he simply worked with his students and adherents to travel and preach the truths that God had revealed to them, at the outpouring in Topeka. Some have accused him of wanting power or a name,⁶⁷ but this seems inconsistent with what he constantly proclaimed.

4. The Year of Thorns

The greatest attacks in Parham's life and ministry were hatched in 296 days between October 1, 1906 to July 24, 1907. After five years of growth and advancement of the infantile Pentecostal Movement (now numbering perhaps 100,000),⁶⁸ suddenly all hell broke loose. Three distinct events arose, which would be thorns in his flesh the rest of his days. These three events are related to Zion City, IL and Wilbur Glenn Voliva; Azusa Street Revival in Los Angeles, CA, and William J. Seymour; and San Antonio, TX, with an allegation Parham declared to be connected to Voliva as well. Any of these events might have stopped lesser men from continuing to carry on public ministry, but the indefatigable Charles Parham was all the more determined to carry on the call God had placed on his life.

The first thorn: Voliva declared a "hot war" against Parham

In mid to late September 1906, Parham went to Zion City, IL.⁶⁹ He felt the call of God to go to Zion City during the annual camp meeting of the Apostolic Faith in September 1906 in Baxter Springs, KS.⁷⁰ He had also been asked by Seymour to come to Los Angeles⁷¹ and help him with fanaticism problems arising at the revival at Azusa Street. "However it must have been the plan of God to let the wheat and the tares grow together (speaking of the problems at Azusa), as Mr. Parham was definitely led to go to Zion City first."⁷² Some will later argue that it was Parham's desire to take advantage of the leadership vacuum in Zion⁷³ that led him to go there, before responding to Seymour's appeal for help with fanaticism, hypnotism, and spiritists. It is difficult to determine one's motives and know to whom God is speaking what. But if one accepts Parham at his own word, then one accepts that he felt God leading him to Zion, before he went to Los Angeles. Both places, and San Antonio to follow, were to become hornet nests for him.

John Alexander Dowie, a divine healing evangelist with a tremendous following from the United Kingdom to Australia and then to the United States, had founded a Christian utopia at Zion City, IL, in 1900.⁷⁴ Parham had visited Dowie in Chicago sometime between March and October 1900, on his trip to visit faith healers and restorationist ministers.⁷⁵ Zion City had but one church, the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church, alongside banks, businesses, and all the elements of a modern city. At this city though, no hospital aid or doctors were allowed, as everyone was to receive their divine healing. All businesses were owned by the church and

everyone worked for the common good. Dowie insisted on racial equality in Zion; well ahead of his time.⁷⁶

Dowie's physical health declined in 1905 after suffering a stroke,⁷⁷ Parham arrived in October 1906,⁷⁸ and Dowie continued to decline in health and subsequently died in 1907. During his decline he called on an associate, Wilbur Glenn Voliva, to lead the church and city on his behalf. Dowie signed over temporary leadership to Voliva to serve as "power of attorney." He abused the trust placed in him by Dowie and quickly removed Dowie from all authority. Voliva accused Dowie of misappropriating church funds and polygamy. When Dowie returned to reassert his authority, Voliva successfully blocked it legally and had asserted himself as leader.⁷⁹ Voliva was to become Parham's "thorn in the flesh, a messenger of Satan to buffet him" (2 Cor. 12:7).

Voliva ruled the church and city with an iron fist. He thrived on posting signs around the city such as, "Tobacco – You have no more right to pollute with tobacco smoke, the atmosphere which clean people have to breathe, than you have to spit in the water which they have to drink. W. G. Voliva."⁸⁰ Another sign at the entrance of the city read, "Zion City; no tobacco, no whisky, no beer, no theaters, no doctors, no drugs, no pork, no oysters. A clean city for a clean people."⁸¹ Voliva accused Dowie of fraud, yet before he died, it is reported that he tearfully confessed to misappropriating church funds as well.⁸²

Parham approached ministry in Zion with trepidation. He felt God calling him there. He felt the people were like sheep without a shepherd.

Dr. Dowie had been discredited and displaced and the people were in a terrible state of confusion and unrest. Hatred and malice, envy and strife reigned in this place which had been planned for a city of righteousness and peace. From a natural standpoint, it looked like a very unfavorable time to go to Zion City with any hopes of having a meeting, but "all things are possible with God" and He can make a way, where seemingly there is no way.⁸³

Parham at this time in Zion, as everywhere else he went. had no intention of starting a church or denomination. "Now, we do not come to establish another church. We are not a new sect. We haven't anything for you to join. We proclaim a revolution. A revolution against sin, sin in the church and out of the church, sin in high places and low places."⁸⁴ He acknowledged that it was an unfavorable time to go, but obeyed God's leading, went to Zion, and experienced the first stab of the thorn that would be with him the rest of his life.

Parham began meetings in Elijah Hospice⁸⁵ but was quickly removed, and they had to instead meet in large homes of those who wanted his ministry.⁸⁶ “He then began cottage meetings and many of the best homes in the city were opened for meetings. Fred F. Bosworth’s home was literally converted into a meeting house.”⁸⁷ These home meetings produced fruit of unity, faith, and love. Hundreds of people identified with Parham and gravitated toward his ministry,⁸⁸ which was similar to what Dowie taught in restoring healing and other miraculous elements to the church.

“Even though bitterly persecuted, as a result of these meetings and others that followed, hundreds were reclaimed from a backslidden state, marvelous healings took place[,] and Pentecost fell profusely. Hundreds of ministers, evangelists[,] and workers went out from Zion City after these meetings, with deeper truth and a fuller gospel than they had previously known[,] and some of them are still among the leading preachers of the world today.”⁸⁹ The ministry in Zion was fruitful. “With Zion in disarray, Parham reached for the harvest in Dowie’s demise. And harvest he did. Hundreds of Dowie’s followers, including much of Zion’s leadership, joined forces with Parham; many would later rise to prominence in the Pentecostal [M]ovement.”⁹⁰ Goff reports, “By the end of September [1906,] Parham had garnered well over [300] followers in Zion City. Newspapers reported that ‘thousands’ were attending his collection of home-style Bible meetings throughout the city ... Even more impressive that the numbers were the valuable converts ... George A. Rogers, manager of the Elijah Hospice and a deacon in Voliva’s church ... A. F. Lee, secretary of the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church ... [and] W. H. Peckham, former manager of the Zion City bank.”⁹¹ The New York Times headline on 27 September 1906 read, “New Leader in Zion City: Says a Voice He Heard in a Vision Inspired Him—Voliva Alarmed.”⁹² Voliva, a man who sought to squelch every rising leader, reacted strongly to this nationally-recognized threat to his rule.

Voliva declared a “hot war”⁹³ against Parham and all those who were hearing his teaching. Rather than embracing Parham for the unity, faith, and love he was bringing to the city, he felt threatened and sought to drive him and all of his followers out. He posted signs at the entrance of the city as follows:

You know that this city is the private headquarters of the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church and a place of residence for its officers and members. Those who break in here and attempt to hold meetings of any kind[,] especially to run a disgraceful monkey-house[,] are nothing but thieves and thugs. Old Parham from Sodom made fools and

monkeys out of you. Either repent of your idiotic performances, and line up for God and Zion, or pack up your stuff and get out of there and establish a zoo somewhere else. W. B. Voliva.⁹⁴

Another sign read,

A perfectly plain notice. This city was established by Zion people and for Zion people only. It is the exclusive headquarters of the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion and the private home of its officers and members. No gentleman, not to mention a Christian, would break into a church settlement and attempt to hold meetings or to establish a counter-organization. Those who do are nothing more nor less than religious bums, tramps, and vagabonds, with less honor than a gang of highway robbers and thugs. Get out of this community if you have a drop of honest blood and go and establish a settlement of your own! Persons coming in here to hold meetings at the invitation of traitors, porch-climbers, election thieves, and tally-sheet mutilators need not expect any courtesy from Zion. An ecclesiastical “goat-house” or “garbage-dump” has no right within this settlement. The war is on red hot and will be waged day and night until every traitor goes to his own place! – Wilbur Glenn Voliva⁹⁵

The hatred was evident in the heart of this man who had forced Dowie from the city he founded and now sought to drive out Parham, who was bringing reconciliation to its hurting and disillusioned members.

Parham however saw this persecution as part of the task of following Christ and continued about his work. His concern was for those who had come to know Christ and Pentecost. Years later on his 40th birthday, he stated: “For my enemies I have only an abiding sympathy; no words of condemnation, but only sorrow for the souls, who, through their fight on me, have been wrecked and ruined. I think the greatest sorrow of my life is the thought that my enemies, in seeking my destruction, have ruined and destroyed so many precious souls.”⁹⁶

Parham would return to Zion City again in December 1906 (2 months), April 1907, December 1908, and August 1914, winter of 1916, to continue to minister among those who had received the teachings of Pentecost. At one time in 1907, there were 2,000 people in attendance⁹⁷ at a Parham meeting in Zion (a city that had only about 6,000 residents in 1902).⁹⁸ He was not intimidated by the messenger of Satan. He returned to Zion as Paul returned to Ephesus, Philippi, and Thessalonica, after receiving persecution and threats.

The second thorn: the break with Seymour

“It was about the last of October 1906 that Mr. Parham felt free to leave the work in Zion City in the care of others and hurried to Los Angeles, Cal. to answer the call from W. J. Seymour.”⁹⁹ Seymour had requested help in his letters because “Satan is working.”¹⁰⁰ There was fanaticism happening (hypnotists, spiritists, and others) in the Azusa Street Revival that concerned Seymour and he requested the “God’s leader in the Apostolic Faith Movement”¹⁰¹ to come help him straighten out.

William J. Seymour had been a student in the Bethel Bible School in Houston in January to the spring of 1906.¹⁰² Seymour was an African-American man who had a great interest in spiritual things and became acquainted with Parham through Lucy Farrar (also spelled Farrow), a mulatto pastor.¹⁰³ Parham defied the culture of the South in Texas by inviting Seymour into his classroom.¹⁰⁴ While Parham was progressive in his desegregation ideas and inclusiveness of African-Americans,¹⁰⁵ a falsehood emerged in 1914 that Seymour was forced to sit outside the classroom and it has brought charges of racism ever since. Charles Shumway in his dissertation wrote, “According to the custom of the section, colored people were allowed to visit meetings of white people under some circumstances, but they must remain in the rear and keep silent.”¹⁰⁶ Although this falsehood has been debunked by numerous associates of Parham,¹⁰⁷ the falsehood that Seymour was not allowed in the classroom continues to be told.¹⁰⁸ Charles and Sarah Parham had Lucy Farrar travel with them and live in their home. They rejoiced when African-Americans came to the Lord, were healed, or filled with the Holy Spirit. “O, the happy faces was a sight to gladden any Christian’s heart! Then for a final climax, Auntie—the colored cook—came rushing down the dining hall stairs saying, ‘I just can’t stand it any longer — Praise the Lord,’ [w]hile she grasped his hand in a hearty hand-shake.”¹⁰⁹ The joy expressed by the Parhams at this African-American’s testimony does not appear to be the heart of a racist.

Parham paid the fare for Seymour to go to Los Angeles.¹¹⁰ Parham wanted everyone from every nation to be saved.¹¹¹ There is not sufficient space in this paper to deal with all of the accusations against Parham related to racism, but this man, who defied culture to have an African-American man study in the classroom and had an African-American woman (Lucy Farrar) preach in their meetings, should be given a fair trial concerning these accusations.¹¹² Gohr treats the racial issue in light of the culture of his times, stating,

Although Parham no doubt has his shortcomings, he played a significant role in the lives of these two individuals [Seymour and Lucy Farrow] as well as in many others in the emerging Pentecostal movement which grew out of Topeka, Houston, Azusa, and other focal points, and now, over a century later, has spread the flames of revival to all parts of the globe. Rather than contributing to racism, it would be better to look at Charles Parham as one who contributed to the inter-racial character of early Pentecostalism, because of his mentorship of Seymour, Farrow, and many others.¹¹³

Parham had earlier written that “it must have been the plan of God to let the wheat and the tares grow together.”¹¹⁴ His words may have been prophetic. Both Parham and Seymour perhaps acted out of their God-given personalities, just as Paul and Barnabas might have in their conflict.¹¹⁵ When Parham arrived at the revival, he saw the fanaticism. He knew the reproach that could be brought to the movement, with people speaking gibberish and ladies laying on the laps of men supposedly in the Spirit.¹¹⁶ He spoke up forcefully attempting to help his disciple, Seymour, to bring order to the meetings. Seymour however had seen a mighty move of God even in spite of the fanaticism. Bartleman observed that when the abuses had been addressed in the Azusa Street meetings, the Spirit had been quenched as well.¹¹⁷ Though Seymour wanted the fanaticism stopped, he was unwilling to quench the Spirit to reassert order. If the tares must grow among the wheat, so be it. The revival should go forward. If the choice is order without revival or revival with some fanaticism, Seymour chose the latter while Parham chose the former. Parham’s own words became a reality, although he would have preferred to pulled the tares out himself.

Seymour’s leaders did not allow Parham back into the Azusa Street mission. ”After preaching two or three times, I was informed by two of the elders, one who was a hypnotist (I had seen him lay his hands on many who came through chattering, jabbering, and sputtering, speaking in no language at all) that I was not wanted in that place.¹¹⁸ Parham opened a meeting in Los Angeles and ministered there having a several hundred people in attendance.¹¹⁹ The break with Seymour was a painful one causing reflection.

Parham had considered himself and his disciples the pushers of the applectart. Seymour gave credit to Parham as “God’s leader in the Apostolic Faith Movement,” in his first Apostolic Faith (Azusa) paper in September 1906, but after their split, he took away this title and said that “we honor Jesus as the great Shepherd of the sheep” in the December issue in 1906.¹²⁰ Some other people had used other titles like “pope,” and he had even called himself “projector” of the movement.¹²¹ But after leaving Los Angeles, Parham renounced all titles and simply chose to

continue pushing the applecart without a name or title. The second painful thorn, the loss of a friend, disciple, and leader had been inflicted.

The third thorn: accusation of “unnatural offense”

The third thorn came during 5 days in July 1907. With a team of workers from Kansas and Texas (Houston and Orchard), Parham was conducting meetings in San Antonio. On July 19, 1907, he was accused of “unnatural offense” in the *San Antonio Light*.¹²² Goff states that Parham immediately made the statement that he believed these charges were made by Voliva.¹²³ This may bear weight in that Parham only began to receive sexual accusations and be followed by detectives after his first meetings in Zion.¹²⁴ Parham was accused in San Antonio while he was preaching at San Antonio Mission which was pastored by Lemuel C. Hall, a former disciple of Dowie.¹²⁵ Five days later (July 24, 1907) the charges were dropped by the prosecutor because there was insufficient evidence.¹²⁶

But the religious press closest to Voliva took the story and evidently fabricated it with tales of a person looking through a keyhole,¹²⁷ a written confession from Parham¹²⁸, and the witness of a disgruntled landlady.¹²⁹ Voliva had a history of accusing those he opposed of sexual misconduct including, “‘Bingley, a self-confessed dirty old kisser;’ ‘Fockler, a self-confessed adulterer;’ and ‘Brudder Tom, ... an immoral man ... caught ... hugging and kissing Sister Hall’ ... ‘the accusation of sodomy against one of Dowie’s overseers.’”¹³⁰ While it is unlikely after a century that concrete evidence will ever be unearthed to prove Voliva’s connection to the rumors, the accusation of July 1907, or to the newspaper reports that circulated in the *Zion Herald*, the *Burning Bush* of Waukesha, and the *Waukegan Daily Sun*, one might consider taking Parham at his word, otherwise known for his truthfulness, and that Voliva (often known for his lies) concocted and fanned the entire immoral accusation, inflicting the third thorn in his flesh in less than one year.

Parham committed to serve Christ, in spite of a ruined reputation. “He now saw that if Christ, the Son of God, could accomplish His Father’s will without reputation and honor from men, he too, must continue in the work of God, walk even as He walked, not backed up by men but by the power of God. Christ said, I receive not honor from men. John 5:41.”¹³¹ He worked to never speak evil of others.¹³² Even his own children were unaware of the accusation, which demonstrates his desire to not infect his children with hatred toward others.¹³³ Is it not interesting

that Parham never had any accusations or rumors concerning his moral integrity before Voliva declared a “hot war” with him? All embellished news articles originated near Voliva. All the posters posted in any location where Parham preached mirrored the postings of Voliva around Zion City.

These posters, printing Parham’s alleged confession, were widely distributed by the followers of Wilbur Glenn Voliva in Zion City, Illinois. The poster reads in part, “I hereby confess my guilt in the commission of the crime of Sodomy with one J. J. Jourdan in San Antonio, Texas on the 18th day of July, 1907. Witness my hand at San Antonio, Texas this 18th day of July 1907. Signed, Chas. F. Parham.” The confession, however, cannot be confirmed by San Antonio court records.¹³⁴

Parham had those advising him to respond to Voliva and other critics. His response was:

When asked why we do not answer criticism, false and unfriendly attacks made upon the work or workers in the paper, we want to say: This is entirely unnecessary and it would be out of place to use the columns of a Christian paper—one devoted to the sacred work of the restoration of the apostolic faith—for is it not to bear the stamp of forgiveness and long suffering; not entering Satan’s arena with low, scurrilous criticisms and strife but to lift up Jesus, and when He is lifted up[,] He will draw all men unto Him.¹³⁵

In it all he chose to allow God to fight for him and he resisted the temptation to attack back.

5. Living with Thorns

The year of thorns had come to an end, but the thorns in his flesh would follow him to his grave. It is possible that Parham prayed for God to take these thorns from him as Paul had prayed. But evidently God gave him the same answer: “My grace is sufficient for you, for my power is made perfect in weakness” (2 Cor. 12:9). He accepted the thorn that Voliva had inflicted him with and he continued to serve God with all his energy. From 1907 onward, the “hot war” was waged solely by Voliva. He posted signs in the towns where Parham preached. Yet Parham zealously plodded on pushing the applecart given to him by God, and thousands were still converted and baptized in the Holy Spirit.

Along with so many other false statements about Parham that continue to live on is the idea that Parham largely gave up his ministry after the year of thorns. This Internet report is typical of the misinformation, “In the last two decades of his life, Parham retired to his home in Baxter Springs, Kansas, where several thousand of his followers attended his annual camp

meetings until his death on January 29, 1929. He is buried in Baxter Springs.”¹³⁶ No one might have faulted Parham if he had retired to his home the last two decades of his life, but that is not what he did.

Parham continued to travel thousands of miles each year. He continued to preach two, three, and sometimes five times a day in cities and towns across America. Candles continued to be lit that took the gospel to every state in the Union that then reached toward every country on the globe. From his base in Kansas he continued to travel¹³⁷ to minister to his followers, many of whom were suffering from similar persecution to his own. His meetings drew thousands of people, both at home and away.¹³⁸ It cannot be truthfully said, “In the last two decades of his life, Parham retired to his home in Baxter Springs, Kansas.”¹³⁹

6. Lasting Influence and Death

About one year before his death, Parham was able to fulfill a life-long dream to visit the Holy Land.¹⁴⁰ On his return trip he had a vision of the presence of God like never before in his life.

I saw no vision of His personality, but knew He was there. I was in the aura of His Presence; all was peace, perfect peace. There was life and that life more abundantly. All darkness vanished; all thought of sin and disease, real or unreal, disappeared. “In His Presence”—then I knew the power of that virtue that went out from Him destroying disease, and I knew there was no sin, no disease in the light of His Presence.¹⁴¹

This man, who was suffering from a stroke¹⁴² was able to experience God’s presence in the midst of his pain.

He returned from this trip and continued his ministry. On a trip to Texas in 1929, he became unconscious caused by a bad heart condition.¹⁴³ His wife and family rushed to his side and brought him home to Baxter Springs, TX. While he was there, the indefatigable Charles Parham longed to go back and fulfill the ministry obligations he had left behind.

He died on January 29, 1929,¹⁴⁴ and when his funeral was held in the middle of a Kansas snowstorm, “Inside and out of the building, the crowd was estimated at 2,500[,] despite the fact that snow fell for some time before the hour of the services and during the time they were being held.”¹⁴⁵ Charles F. Parham had a loving family and loyal following to the end. While he suffered persecution and false accusations, those who had accepted his ministry gathered to show their love one last time to the projector, leader and founder of the Latter Rain Apostolic Faith

Movement, and the one who discovered and promoted the Pentecostal theology; the applegate pusher. “The Lord used the Apostolic Faith Movement as an applegate to push the truth of Pentecost along in, until it became a world-wide blessing. It had fulfilled its mission, and now it fades in the light of recognition of a general worldwide fellowship[,] in extending the hand of love to all Full Gospel Movements and Churches. The heritage of this truth is the divine right of all the children of God, and the result cannot be harvested by one man or one movement.”¹⁴⁶

Few people have had such a vast impact on the world. “So the salvation of the Lord flows like a stream and who-so-ever will may come. Few men have lived to see the fruition [*sic*] of their life’s work as has Mr. Parham, all Apostolic missions, Pentecostal missions[,] and Assemblies of God, have their beginning, [directly or indirectly] from Parham’s Bible School at Topeka, Kansas. 1900–1901.”¹⁴⁷ In this day of Presentism and the cancel culture, could the Pentecostal community consider giving honor to whom honor is due?

Could the man who God used to light the candle of this world-wide Pentecostal Movement be remembered for the good that he did; how he changed the world? Could the false accusations be minimized rather than magnified? Could the theologies we do not accept be forgiven, while the theological advances he brought be remembered? Could it be that the Pentecostal Movement does have a theological human father in Charles F. Parham? And could we not feel comfortable honoring him for that, even if we do not celebrate all that he believed?

Charles Parham was a man who dared to believe that the Bible evidence for the baptism in the Holy Spirit is speaking in tongues. He believed that this rediscovered truth should belong to every believer in every church, no matter the person’s preferred denomination. He believed that this great latter-day rain would be the impetus to the gospel being preached to the whole world, before the Second Coming of the Lord Jesus Christ. He preached tirelessly numerous times a day for over three decades in small towns and cities across this nation, reportedly personally leading over two million people into relationship with Jesus Christ, as well as many of them being healed and experiencing the baptism in the Holy Spirit. He continued to preach even through the persecution and thorns in his flesh inflicted by the enemy. His wife and children believed his message and continued the ministry after his death. His followers flocked to his funeral through a Kansas snow storm by the thousands.

As this generation of ministers study the life of Charles F. Parham, may these individuals not be distracted by the flaws in his character, the differences in his doctrine, or by the current

values mistakenly superimposed from an earlier point in history. But may this and future generations of ministers be inspired by the good and godly elements of his life. May this generation of ministers seek, like Parham, to simply be an applecart pusher to advance the truth of Pentecost along, until it becomes a world-wide blessing. May this generation of ministers be indefatigable, preaching day and night, until millions of people come into a relationship with God through Jesus Christ.

Bibliography

Apostolic Faith (Azusa), December 1906.

Apostolic Faith (Azusa), September 1906.

Bartleman, Frank. *Azusa Street*. Whitaker House. Kindle Edition.

Christian Flat Earth Ministry. <https://christianflatearthministry.org/2016/05/26/proposal-have-the-first-international-conference-of-flat-earthers/>.

Connelley, William C. *A Standard History of Kansas and Kansans*, Chicago: Lewis Publishing Co. 1928.

<http://www.cogic.org/blog/cogic-history-bishop-c-h-mason/>.

“Dowie, John Alexander: a prohibitionist masterclass,” Churchmouse Campanologist, <https://churchmousec.wordpress.com/2012/07/08/john-alexander-dowie-a-prohibitionist-masterclass/>

“Dowie, John Alexander” *Apostolic Archives*, Joplin, MO. <https://www.apostolicarchives.com/articles/article/8801925/173152.htm>.

“Dowie, John Alexander,” *Britannica*. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/John-Alexander-Dowie> (accessed July 6, 2020).

Flower, J. Roswell. *Enrichment Journal*, www.enrichmentjournal.ag.org, Fall 1999.

Fox, Charles R. Jr. and Vinson Synan. *William J. Seymour: Pioneer of the Azusa Street Revival*. 2012.

“Free Love”, *Apostolic Faith* (Baxter Springs, KS): 1912, Dec. quoted in *The Azusa Street Revival and Its Legacy* edited by Harold D. Hunter, Cecil M. Robeck.

Goff, James. *Fields White Unto Harvest* (Series) (p. 124). University of Arkansas Press. Kindle Edition.

- Gohr, Glenn W. "Charles F. Parham: Interacting with Culture in the Context of his Belief System," History Interest Group, Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Presented at the 45th [sic. actually 46th] Annual Meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies. Mar 9-11, 2017 at St. Louis, Missouri.
- Goss, Ethel. *The Winds of God: The Story of the Early Pentecostal Movement (1901-1914) in the Life of Howard A. Goss*. Picton, Ontario: Goswood Lodge, 1958. Kindle Edition.
- Harlan, Rolvix. *John Alexander Dowie and the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion*, dissertation submitted to the University of Chicago, 1906.
- Howard, Bernard N. "Luther's Jewish Problem". October 19, 2017 Christian Living. <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/luthers-jewish-problem/>.
- Houston Chronicle*, Quoted in Life of Charles Parham, from 1906 Brunner, Tx meetings, Loc. 1984.
- Jacobs, Joseph (1901). "Anglo-Israelism". In Singer, Isidore (ed.). *Jewish Encyclopedia: Anglo-Israelism*. New York: Funk and Wagnalls.
- Knight, Henry H. *From Aldersgate to Azusa Street*. 1910.
- Luther, Martin. *On the Jews and Their Lies*, 1543. Translated by Martin H. Bertram. https://www.prchiz.pl/storage/app/media/pliki/Luther_On_Jews.pdf.
- MacRobert, Iain (1988). *The Black Roots and White Racism of Early Pentecostalism in the USA*. London: Macmillan Press.
- McGee, Gary B. and Darrin J. Rodgers, "The Assemblies of God: Our Heritage in Perspective," Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Springfield, MO: iphc.org (accessed April 13, 2017). <https://www.ncpedia.org/church-god-christ>
- Nelson, Jeff. Pentecostal Missions: Past 100 and Beyond, *International Journal of Pentecostal Missiology* (Dec. 2019) 6:1.
- Parham, Charles, *Apostolic Faith* (Baxter Springs) 1927 January, copied from the document located at the Apostolic Heritage Museum, Joplin, MO on June 16, 2020 by author.
- Parham, Sarah (Mrs.) *The Life of Charles Parham: Founder of the Apostolic Faith Movement* (Pentecostal Pioneers Book 18). Revival Library. Kindle Edition.
- Parham, Pauline. "Our Pentecostal Heritage." Lecture given at Christ For the Nations Institute, Dallas, Texas, May 1989.

Pew Research. <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/04/06/why-muslims-are-the-worlds-fastest-growing-religious-group/>.

“Presentism” <https://www.lexico.com/en/definition/presentism>.

Robins, R. G. *Pentecostalism in America*. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger. 27.

Rodgers, Darrin. C. M. *Hanson and the Pre-Azusa Pentecostal Revival Among Scandinavian-Americans*. Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center. <https://ifphc.wordpress.com/tag/north-dakota/>.

Sarles, K. L. (1988). *An appraisal of the signs and wonders movement*. *Bibliotheca Sacra*, 145(577).

“Seymour, William J. https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_J._Seymour.

Seymour’s letter to Parham, August 27, 1906. Parham, Mrs. *The Life of Charles Parham: Founder of the Apostolic Faith Movement (Pentecostal Pioneers Book 18)*. Revival Library. Kindle Edition.

“Signs of the Older Times,” Shorpy, <https://www.shorpy.com/node/1234>.

Sullivan, Charles A. *The Irvingites and the Gift of Tongues*, October 5, 2010, <https://charlesasullivan.com/1826/the-irvingites-and-the-gift-of-tongues/#anch4>.

Shumway, Charles. “A Critical History of ‘The Gift of Tongues.’” A. B. diss., University of Southern California, 1914.

Tate, Dylan. “Parham Research Paper”, Assemblies of God Theological Seminary. February 2020, Unpublished Paper.

“Voliva, Wilbur Glenn.” Alamy, <https://www.alamy.com/sign-at-the-border-of-the-city-of-zion-illinois-usa-image66180804.html>.

“Voliva, Wilbur Glenn.” Alamy. <https://www.alamy.com/sign-at-the-border-of-the-city-of-zion-illinois-usa-image66180804.html>.

Weigel, George. *World Christianity by the Numbers*, 2. 25. 15, [Firstthings.com](https://www.firstthings.com/web-exclusives/2015/02/world-christianity-by-the-numbers). <https://www.firstthings.com/web-exclusives/2015/02/world-christianity-by-the-numbers>.

Wishart, David J. Ed. “Parham, Charles F. 1873-1929” *Encyclopedia of the Great Plains*. University of Nebraska, 2011. <http://plainshumanities.unl.edu/encyclopedia/doc/egp.rel.038>.

Wuthnow, Robert. *American Misfits and the Making of Middle-Class Respectability*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2017.

¹ Parham uses this word to describe his tireless ministry. *Parham, Sarah (Mrs.) The Life of Charles Parham: Founder of the Apostolic Faith Movement* (Pentecostal Pioneers Book 18). Revival Library. Kindle Edition. Loc. 4906.

² *Ibid.*, Loc. 2259-2267. Parham uses this term to describe his Apostolic ministry to spread the full gospel message to the world.

³ These three movements, though related in that they all recognize speaking in tongues are a gift that God is giving to today's church, are different theologically. Pentecostals hold that speaking in tongues is not only a gift of the Spirit (1 Cor. 12 and 14) but also the initial physical evidence that a person is baptized in (or filled with) the Holy Spirit (Acts 2:4). Charismatics and Third Wave theology generally holds to the belief that speaking in tongues is a gift of the Spirit, but both traditions do not agree that it is for all believers, nor is it an evidence that people are baptized in the Holy Spirit. The modern Pentecostal movement began on January 1, 1901. The Charismatic movement marks its origins in 1960, when Dennis Bennett, an Episcopalian priest announced to his congregation in Van Nuys, California that he had received the outpouring of the Holy Spirit. This movement was primarily among the mainline and Catholic churches. The Third Wave movement was identified by C. Peter Wagner in 1983 and the third wave constituents are "Evangelicals from Reformed and Dispensational backgrounds who have experienced [a] paradigm shift and now believe that the miraculous or sign gifts portrayed in the Gospels and Book of Acts continue to the present." Sarles, K. L. (1988). An appraisal of the signs and wonders movement. *Bibliotheca Sacra*, 145(577), 57-82.

⁴ George Weigel, World Christianity by the Numbers, 2. 25. 15, Firstthings.com. <https://www.firstthings.com/web-exclusives/2015/02/world-christianity-by-the-numbers>

⁵ Jeff Nelson, Pentecostal Missions: Past 100 and Beyond, *International Journal of Pentecostal Missiology* (Dec. 2019) 6:1, 25.

⁶ Pew Research. <https://www.pewresearch.org/fact-tank/2017/04/06/why-muslims-are-the-worlds-fastest-growing-religious-group/>

⁷ Nelson, 26.

⁸ Speaking in Tongues from the Second to Nineteenth Centuries were largely local in geography and limited in duration to one to two generations of believers. Second Century - Justin Martyr (100 – 165) (Rome), Irenaeus (130 – 202) (Lyon, France), Tertullian (155 – 230), Montanus of Phrygia; Third Century - Asterius Urbanus (232), Novatian (258), Origen (Alexandria, Egypt), Pochomius; Fourth Century- Hilary (300 – 367), Ambrose (340 – 397), John Chrysostom (347 – 407), Augustine (354 – 430) (Algeria), Eusebius; Fifth Century - St. Patrick of Ireland; Tenth Century - Symeon the New Theologian (Turkey), Andrew the Fool for Christ of Constantinople; Twelfth Century - Waldenses (1100s), Albigenses (1100s), Thomas Aquinas (Italy), St. Hildegard of Bingen; Thirteenth Century - Franciscans (1200s) (Assisi, Italy), Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) (Italy); Thirteenth Century - Franciscans (1200s) (Assisi, Italy), Thomas Aquinas (1225-1274) (Italy); Fifteenth Century - St. Vincent Ferrer; Sixteenth Century - Martin Luther, Anabaptists (1500s), Ignatius (Loyola, Spain), Prophecy Movement (1500s), Huguenots; Seventeenth Century - Camisards (1600s – 1700s), Quakers (1600s), Jansenist (1600s – 1700s) (France), Pietists (1600s); Eighteenth Century – Moravians, Methodists (1700s), Whitefield followers, Shakers, Seraphim of Sarov (Russia); Nineteenth Century - Irvingites (1800s), Gustav von Bellow, D. L. Moody, R. B. Swan, Kara Kara of Armenia, Switzerland, Scandinavians in ND MN.

⁹ Edward Irving came close to identifying tongues as a Bible evidence to the baptism of the Holy Spirit but did not fully arrive at this theology. He saw speaking in tongues as a sign that the interpretation that followed would be from God, but not necessarily that tongues were the evidence of the baptism in the Holy Spirit. [Tongues are] "a sign that human intervention, error, manipulation, intellectual play, ritual, or structure are not involved. The Spirit has overridden humankind and the person. What proceeds after that in interpretation or prophecy is straight-up-goods

from God.” Charles A. Sullivan. The Irvingites and the Gift of Tongues, October 5, 2010, <https://charlesasullivan.com/1826/the-irvingites-and-the-gift-of-tongues/#anch4>.

¹⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2642.

¹¹ MacRobert, Iain (1988). *The Black Roots and White Racism of Early Pentecostalism in the USA*. London: Macmillan Press. 56.

¹² J. Roswell Flower, www.enrichmentjournal.ag.org, Fall 1999. Flower gave two possible exceptions: with the possible exception of the Church of God and the Girls Home in India operated by Pandita Ramabai. However, I contend that even these two exceptions have direct links to Parham. The Church of God in Christ became Pentecostal through its founder, Charles Harrison Mason, after receiving the Baptism in the Holy Spirit with speaking in tongues at Azusa (<https://www.ncpedia.org/church-god-christ>). The Girls Home in India received Pentecost through correspondence with Azusa Street.

¹³ Darrin Rodgers, C. M. Hanson and the Pre-Azusa Pentecostal Revival Among Scandinavian-Americans. Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, <https://ifphc.wordpress.com/tag/north-dakota/>. C. M. Hanson was baptized in the Holy Spirit with the gift of tongues in 1899. “Hanson soon identified with the emerging Pentecostal movement in Chicago, which had its roots in the 1906 Azusa Street revival in Los Angeles. Chicago Pentecostal leader William Durham ordained Hanson in 1909, and Hanson transferred his ordination to the Assemblies of God in 1917. In 1922, when the Assemblies of God organized churches and ministers in Minnesota, Wisconsin, and the Dakotas into the North Central District, participants unanimously elected Hanson to serve as the district’s first chairman.” This point illustrates that he was speaking in tongues prior to the Topeka outpouring, but he officially joined the Pentecostal movement later.

¹⁴ The Church of God in Christ was formed in 1897 and joined the Pentecostal movement and theology in 1907 after Bishop C. H. Mason visited Azusa Street and was baptized in the Holy Spirit with speaking in tongues. <http://www.cogic.org/blog/cogic-history-bishop-c-h-mason/>

¹⁵ Apostolic Faith (1906) formed in Portland, OR by Florence L. Crawford, who was affiliated with William J. Seymour and the Azusa Street Revival of Los Angeles, CA. Church of God in Christ founded by C. H. Mason (1897) see note above. Church of God (Cleveland, TN) established by A. J. Tomlinson (1906). He received the baptism in the Holy Spirit in 1908 through the ministry of Gaston B. Cashwell, who had received the Pentecostal experience and doctrine through Azusa Street in 1906. Other early Pentecostal denominations have similar stories and ties back to Parham, many of them through Azusa Street.

¹⁶ The first eight executive presbyters of the Assemblies of God all had relationship to Parham as follows. Howard A. Goss received salvation via Parham in Galena, KS (1902) and received the Holy Spirit baptism via train to Alvin, TX (1906); Cyrus B. Fockler received Holy Spirit baptism via Parham in Zion, IL (1906); D. C. O. Opperman received Holy Spirit baptism via Parham in Houston, TX (1906); John W. Welch received Holy Spirit baptism in Oklahoma (1910-1911) through some Pentecostal service (Parham began holding Pentecostal meetings in Oklahoma in 1904). At the first General Council in 1914 he served as pastor in Baxter Springs, KS where Parham lived and had his headquarters; E. N. Bell received Holy Spirit baptism via William Durham, Chicago via Azusa via Parham; J. Roswell Flower received Holy Spirit baptism via Glenn Cook (Indianapolis, IN) and Mary Moise (St. Louis, MO) via Azusa via Parham; Mack M. Pinson received Holy Spirit baptism via G. B. Cashwell (Birmingham, AL and Memphis, TN) via Azusa, via Parham; Thomas K. Leonard received Holy Spirit baptism via Claude McKinnney (Akron, OH) via Ivey G. Campbell (E. Liverpool, OH), via Azusa via Parham. This lineage of mentioned recipients is similar in other Pentecostal denominations.

¹⁷ Nelson, 27.

¹⁸ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2259-2267.

¹⁹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 98; Goff, Loc. 511.

²⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 116 and 121; Goff, Loc. 517 and 626.

²¹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 109, 484 and 498; Goff, Loc. 594 and 863.

²² Parham, Sarah, Loc. 150; Goff, Loc. 667.

²³ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 334; Goff, Loc. 748 (Eudora) and 764 (Linwood).

²⁴ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 367; Goff, Loc. 826.

²⁵ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 21, 115, and 1026.

²⁶ Ibid., Loc. 444.

²⁷ Ibid., Loc. 46 and 1047.

²⁸ Ibid., Loc. 744, 755, 765, and 1001.

²⁹ Ibid., Loc. 757, 816, and 2301.

³⁰ Ibid., Loc. 254.

³¹ Ibid., Loc. 5240.

³² Jacobs, Joseph (1901). "Anglo-Israelism". In Singer, Isidore (ed.). *Jewish Encyclopedia: Anglo-Israelism*. New York: Funk and Wagnalls. p. 600. ISBN 978-1117918952.

³³ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 682.

³⁴ Ibid., Loc. 1237, 1274, 3951 and 5697.

³⁵ Ibid., Loc. 744, 755, 765, and 1001.

³⁶ Ibid., Loc. 1876, 1885, 2086, 3297, 3348, 5141, 5244, and 5325.

³⁷ Ibid., Loc. 43, 2496, 5341.

³⁸ "Presentism" <https://www.lexico.com/en/definition/presentism>

³⁹ Martin Luther, *On the Jews and Their Lies*, 1543. Translated by Martin H. Bertram. https://www.prchiz.pl/storage/app/media/pliki/Luther_On_Jews.pdf. Martin Luther's writings were used by the Nazis as justification for the Holocaust.

⁴⁰ Bernard N. Howard, *Luther's Jewish Problem*. October 19, 2017 *Christian Living*. <https://www.thegospelcoalition.org/article/luthers-jewish-problem/>

⁴¹ Joel 2:23 and Hosea 6:3.

⁴² Parham, Sarah, Loc. 720.

⁴³ Ibid., Loc. 792.

⁴⁴ Ibid., Loc. 802.

⁴⁵ Ibid., Loc. 734.

⁴⁶ Ibid., Loc. 738.

⁴⁷ Ibid., Loc. 735.

⁴⁸ Ibid., Loc. 739-763.

⁴⁹ Weigel, 1.

⁵⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 35 and 5145.

⁵¹ Houston Chronicle, Quoted in Life of Charles Parham, from 1906 Brunner, Tx meetings, Loc. 1984.

⁵² Gary B. McGee and Darrin J. Rodgers, "The Assemblies of God: Our Heritage in Perspective," Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Springfield, MO: iphc.org (accessed April 13, 2017).

⁵³ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 724 and 1788.

⁵⁴ Ibid., Loc. 150.

⁵⁵ Ibid., Loc. 176, 1033, 1304, 1531, 1599, 1736, 3258, and 5024.

⁵⁶ Ibid., Loc. 2036.

⁵⁷ Ibid., Loc. 718, 1782, and 1833.

⁵⁸ Ibid., Loc. 375, 566, and 701.

⁵⁹ Ibid., Loc. 492, 572, and 5380.

⁶⁰ Ibid., Loc. 348, 415, 434, 575, 610, 621, 1024, and many others.

⁶¹ Ibid., Loc. 1949.

⁶² A Standard History of Kansas and Kansans, by William C. Connelley (Chicago: Lewis Publishing Co. 1928); Parham, Loc. 5581.

⁶³ In 1906 before Azusa Street 100,000 people believed, during the first 5 years would be 55 people per day. A year before his death in 1928, 2,000,000 people believed, would be about 202 people per day during the first 27 years. In 2015 with 650 million Pentecostal/Charismatic people would be 15,469 people per day, who have come into the modern Pentecostal Movement since its inception on January 1, 1901.

⁶⁴ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 4906.

⁶⁵ Parham, Charles, Apostolic Faith (Baxter Springs) 1927 January, copied from the document located at the Apostolic Heritage Museum, Joplin, MO on June 16, 2020 by author.

⁶⁶ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2259-2267.

⁶⁷ This was the opinion of James Goff. “He clearly desired leadership and his “resignation” resulted from both his frustration at having lost authority and his desperate hope to gain it back. But he would never enjoy so much authority again.” Goff, Loc. 134.

⁶⁸ Ibid., Loc. 1949.

⁶⁹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2017, 2020.

⁷⁰ Ibid., Loc. 2017.

⁷¹ Seymour’s letter to Parham, August 27, 1906. Parham, Location 2002 and 2017.

⁷² Ibid., Loc. 2020.

⁷³ Goff, Loc. 2236.

⁷⁴ “Dowie, John Alexander,” Britannica. <https://www.britannica.com/biography/John-Alexander-Dowie> (accessed July 6, 2020).

⁷⁵ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 689.

⁷⁶ “Dowie,” Britannica.

⁷⁷ Rolvix Harlan, John Alexander Dowie and the Christian Catholic Apostolic Church in Zion, dissertation submitted to the University of Chicago, 1906. 22. https://books.google.com/books?id=8SgXAAAAYAAJ&pg=PP5&dq=dowie+stroke+1905&source=gbs_selected_pages&cad=3#v=onepage&q=dowie%20stroke%201905&f=false.

⁷⁸ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2017 and 2027.

⁷⁹ “John Alexander Dowie,” Apostolic Archives, Joplin, MO. <https://www.apostolicarchives.com/articles/article/8801925/173152.htm>.

⁸⁰ “Signs of the Older Times,” Shorpy, <https://www.shorpy.com/node/1234>

⁸¹ Christian Flat Earth Ministry. <https://christianflatearthministry.org/2016/05/26/proposal-have-the-first-international-conference-of-flat-earthers/>

⁸² “John Alexander Dowie: a prohibitionist masterclass,” Churchmouse Campanologist, <https://churchmousec.wordpress.com/2012/07/08/john-alexander-dowie-a-prohibitionist-masterclass/>

⁸³ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2019.

⁸⁴ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1949.

⁸⁵ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2029.

⁸⁶ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2030-2036.

⁸⁷ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2031.

⁸⁸ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2036. Goff, Loc. 2267.

⁸⁹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2043.

⁹⁰ R. G. Robins, *Pentecostalism in America*. Santa Barbara, CA: Praeger. 27.

⁹¹ Goff. Loc. 2304.

⁹² New York Times, September 27, 1906, p. 7.

⁹³ “Wilbur Glenn Voliva,” Alamy. <https://www.alamy.com/sign-at-the-border-of-the-city-of-zion-illinois-usa-image66180804.html>.

⁹⁴ “Wilbur Glenn Voliva,” Alamy. <https://www.alamy.com/sign-at-the-border-of-the-city-of-zion-illinois-usa-image66180807.html>.

⁹⁵ “Wilbur Glenn Voliva” Alamy, <https://www.alamy.com/sign-at-the-border-of-the-city-of-zion-illinois-usa-image66180804.html>.

⁹⁶ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2561.

⁹⁷ “At the Parham meeting in Zion City, New Year’s night, it is reported that there were 2000 persons in attendance. Parham preached two hours on the baptism of the Holy Ghost.” Parham, Loc. 2216.

⁹⁸ Robert Wuthnow, *American Misfits and the Making of Middle-Class Respectability*. Princeton, NJ: Princeton University Press, 2017. 128.

⁹⁹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2070.

¹⁰⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2002 and 2010. Also, “He was expecting to go to Los Angeles, Cal., as W. J. Seymour was still writing urgent letters appealing for help, as spiritualistic manifestations, hypnotic forces[,] and fleshly contortions as known in the colored Camp Meetings in the south, had broken loose in the meeting.” Loc. 2017.

¹⁰¹ Seymour gave credit to Parham as “God’s leader in the Apostolic Faith Movement.” in his first Apostolic Faith paper in September 1906, but after their split took away this title and said that “we honor Jesus as the great Shepherd of the sheep” in the December issue in 1906. *Apostolic Faith (Azusa)*, September 1906 and December 1906. Seymour, William, *The Azusa Papers*. Jawbone Digital. Kindle Edition. Loc. 39, 1666-1673.

¹⁰² Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1782 and 1795.

¹⁰³ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2084 and 2094.

¹⁰⁴ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1795. Gohr, 2-4.

¹⁰⁵ Gohr, 12.

¹⁰⁶ Charles Shumway in his dissertation entitled “A Critical History of ‘The Gift of Tongues.’” A. B. diss., University of Southern California, 1914. 173.

¹⁰⁷ The falsehood that William Seymour was seated outside the classroom has been debunked by 1. Sarah Parham, *The Life of Charles F. Parham*, p. 137. And 2. Ethel Goss, *The Winds of God*, Loc. 787 (p. 73), and 3. Pauline Parham, 1989 lecture, and 4. *The Apostolic Faith Report* May 1921, p. 5. Gohr refutes these accusations in his

presentation to SPS: Glenn W. Gohr, “Charles F. Parham: Interacting with Culture in the Context of his Belief System,” History Interest Group, Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Presented at the 45th [sic. actually 46th] Annual Meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies. Mar 9-11, 2017 at St. Louis, Missouri. Many original documents on Parham can be found at the Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Springfield, MO; the Apostolic Faith Bible School and Headquarters, Baxter Springs, KS; and at the Apostolic Heritage Museum and Apostolic Archives International, Joplin, MO.

¹⁰⁸ Charles R. Fox, Jr. and Vinson Synan. William J. Seymour: Pioneer of the Azusa Street Revival. 2012. “Parham had Seymour sit in the hallway outside the classroom’s open door.” And Henry H. Knight. From Aldersgate to Azusa Street. 1910. 213. “forced Seymour to sit outside the classroom with the door ajar during classes.” And Wikipedia is a typical example stating that: “Though Seymour's attendance at Parham's school violated Texas Jim Crow laws, with Parham's permission, Seymour simply took a seat just outside the classroom door.” https://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/William_J._Seymour.

¹⁰⁹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1580-1585.

¹¹⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1855.

¹¹¹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 1028, 2266, 3434.

¹¹² Goff makes these fair conclusions concerning Parham’s views on race: It would be erroneous to suggest that Parham ever attained sufficient enlightenment to place him anywhere near Dowie’s policy of racial equality. Nonetheless, it is equally erroneous to suggest, as Nelson has, that in 1905–06, Parham operated from the hard-racial guidelines of W. F. Carothers. Parham’s sensitivity to black people’s needs would decrease with age and in response to his bitter break with Seymour and Azusa Street. Yet the Charles Parham who made provisions for Seymour in December 1905 was far from a ranting, card-carrying racist. Convinced that his race was superior, he was equally sure that his spiritual revelation superseded the constrictions of society. His outreach to blacks in Houston came from a firm conviction that the Pentecostal message was for all races and was bridged in spite of local opposition. Jim Crow legislation and public opinion forced Parham and his Kansas associates to proceed cautiously but they forged on, nonetheless.

In the final analysis Parham was neither a racial reformer nor a champion of white supremacy. Rather, he occupied a paternalistic middle ground typical of many if not most white ministers from the Midwest. His goal was the radical salvation of Christianity in the 20th century through the renewal of Pentecostal power. Missionaries would be endowed with the gift of language to ensure the glorious end time revival. Such a revolutionary goal, of necessity, included all races. Goff, Loc. 2061-2070.

Dylan Tate comes to a similar conclusion: The evidence does not explicitly reveal the dilemma between Parham and Seymour to focus on race issues. The fact that Seymour received his training under Parham does not support that argument. If someone tries to argue that Parham did not know Seymour would lead whites, they speak from silence. The primary issue revealed focuses on fanaticism. Parham took offense of all the “gibberish,” hypnotist, and other unorderly activities taking place.¹¹² When looking at Parham's theological view of British-Israel, it does not support a racist stance. The actions of Parham clear his name. He went to black communities and interacted peaceably with the black people. There were several blacks part of his school and biblical teaching — the evidence of non-hatred stacks up against any claims of racism for Charles F. Parham. Dylan Tate, “Parham Research Paper”, Assemblies of God Theological Seminary. February 2020, Unpublished Paper.

¹¹³ Glenn W. Gohr, “Charles F. Parham: Interacting with Culture in the Context of his Belief System,” History Interest Group, Flower Pentecostal Heritage Center, Presented at the 45th Annual Meeting of the Society for Pentecostal Studies. 12.

¹¹⁴ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2020.

¹¹⁵ In Acts 15:36-41 Barnabas wanted to take (John) Mark with them on their second missionary journey and Paul did not. True to Barnabas' personality as the son of encouragement, he wanted to take John Mark and restore him to ministry after he abandoned the team on the first journey. Paul, true to his personality, was focused on those who had never heard the gospel and did not want to be encumbered by John Mark, who might hinder the missionary work.

¹¹⁶ Parham wrote, "a white woman, perhaps of wealth and culture, could be seen thrown back in the arms of a big 'buck nigger,' and held tightly thus as she shivered and shook in freak imitation of Pentecost." "Free Love", *Apostolic Faith* (Baxter Springs, KS): 1912, Dec. quoted in *The Azusa Street Revival and Its Legacy* edited by Harold D. Hunter, Cecil M. Robeck. 49. Parham's statement here, may speak more of his concern for order than racism.

¹¹⁷ Bartleman states in his book "The Devil overdid himself again. Outside persecution never hurt the work. We had the most to fear from the working of evil spirits within. Even spiritualists and hypnotists came to investigate and to try their influence. Then all the religious soreheads, crooks, and cranks came, seeking a place in the work. We had the most to fear from these. But this is always the danger to every new work; they had no place elsewhere. This condition cast a fear over many that was hard to overcome. It hindered the Spirit much. Many were afraid to seek God for fear the Devil might get them. We found early in the Azusa work that when we attempted to steady the ark, the Lord stopped working. We dared not call the attention of the people too much to the working of the Evil One. Fear would follow. We could only pray—then God gave victory. There was a presence of God with us that, through prayer, we could depend on." Frank Bartleman, *Azusa Street*. Whitaker House. Kindle Edition. Loc. 517-523. Also Dylan Tate, MA Paper.

¹¹⁸ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2110.

¹¹⁹ "With workers from the Texas field we opened a great revival in the W. C. T. U. (Women's Christian Temperance Union) Building on Broadway and Temple Streets in Los Angeles. Great numbers were saved, marvelous healings took place, and between two and three hundred who had been possessed of awful fits and spasms and controls in the Azusa Street work were delivered and received the real Pentecost teachings and many spake with other tongues." Parham, Loc. 2110.

¹²⁰ *Apostolic Faith* (Azusa) September 1906 and December 1906.

¹²¹ "I will quote a piece concerning organisation and leadership which Mr. Parham printed in "The Apostolic Faith" published in Zion City, 1907. "In resigning my position as Projector of the Apostolic Faith Movement, I simply followed a well-considered plan of mine, made years ago, never to receive honor of men, or to establish a new Church. I was called a pope, a Dowie, etc., and everywhere looked upon as a leader or a would-be leader and proselyter. "These designations have always been an abomination to me and since God has given almost universal light to the world on Pentecost there is no further need of my holding the official leadership of the Apostolic Faith Movement. Now that they are generally accepted, I simply take my place among my brethren to push this gospel of the Kingdom as a witness to all nations. "I shall still remain the same to my brethren in assistance, advice, and in donating to them my extra cash, as when I bore the meaningless title of 'Projector.' Parham, Loc. 2259.

¹²² Goff, Loc. 2512.

¹²³ Goff, Loc. 2517.

¹²⁴ Goff, Loc. 2501.

¹²⁵ Goff, Loc. 2519.

¹²⁶ Goff, Loc. 2527. Parham, Loc. 2528.

¹²⁷ Goff, Loc. 4327.

¹²⁸ Goff, Loc. 2561.

¹²⁹ Goff, Loc. 2559.

¹³⁰ Goff, Loc. 4351. Cyrus B Fockler, later to be a founding executive presbyter of the Assemblies of God (1914), fell under similar false accusation and persecution from Voliva.

¹³¹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 401.

¹³² Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2345 and 2385.

¹³³ Goff, Loc. 4385. Parham, Loc. 2345.

¹³⁴ Goff, Loc. 4385. Parham, Loc. 2345.

¹³⁵ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2362-2370.

¹³⁶ David J. Wishart, Ed. "Parham, Charles F. 1873-1929" Encyclopedia of the Great Plains. University of Nebraska, 2011. <http://plainshumanities.unl.edu/encyclopedia/doc/egp.rel.038>.

¹³⁷ His travels took him each year listed to each of these hubs; Zion City, IL (1906, 1907, 1908, 1914, and 1916), Texas (1905, 1906, 1907, 1908, 1909, 1913, 1914, 1916, 1917, 1921, 1923, 1924, 1925, 1927, 1928, 1929), New York (1900, 1907, 1908, 1909, 1927, 1928), and California (1906, 1907, 1908, 1910, 1911, 1912, 1913, 1923, 1924, and 1925) to minister to his followers, many of whom were suffering from similar persecution to his own.

¹³⁸ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 3765, and 3851-3856.

¹³⁹ Wishart.

¹⁴⁰ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 2642, 4369 and 4934. Parham desired to take this trip in 1909 but he was robbed in New York City and was not able to make the trip (Loc. 2642). He left New York for the Holy Land December 3, 1927 (Loc. 4369) and returned April 11, 1928 (Loc. 4934).

¹⁴¹ Parham, Sarah, Loc. 4877.

¹⁴² Ibid., Loc. 4681.

¹⁴³ Ibid., Loc. 5086.

¹⁴⁴ Ibid., Loc. 5145.

¹⁴⁵ Ibid., Loc. 5164.

¹⁴⁶ Ibid., Loc. 2259-2267.

¹⁴⁷ Ibid., Loc. 3956.